





## The Position of Criticism in the History of Medicine Based on "A Critique of the Article, Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the Famous Iranian Physician"

M. Riyahi-Nejad (MA)<sup>\*1</sup> , M. Zahabi (PhD)<sup>1</sup> 

1. Department of History, Faculty of Literature and Humanities, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, I.R.Iran.

Article Type	ABSTRACT
<b>Letter to the Editor</b>	Historical criticism requires expertise and proficiency in general knowledge of history. Without historical knowledge, it is wrong to write a review. In writing the critique of the article "Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the famous Iranian physician", year 2022, volume 24, number 1, none of the principles of historiography criticism have been observed. With a focus on historical geography, there is apparently a difference of opinion between the critics and the author of the article. Therefore, the aim of this article is critical discourse analysis of historiography and the birthplace of Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji.
<b>Received:</b> <b>Apr 30<sup>th</sup> 2022</b>	
<b>Revised:</b> <b>Jun 20<sup>th</sup> 2022</b>	
<b>Accepted:</b> <b>Sep 11<sup>st</sup> 2022</b>	<b>Keywords:</b> <i>History of Medicine, Historical Geography, Annales Historiography, Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji, Toranj.</i>

**Cite this article:** Riyahi-Nejad M, Zahabi M. The Position of Criticism in the History of Medicine Based on "A Critique of the Article, Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the Famous Iranian Physician". *Journal of Babol University of Medical Sciences*. 2023; 25(1): 160-4.



© The Author(S).

Publisher: Babol University of Medical Sciences

**\*Corresponding Author: M. Riyahi-Nejad (MA)**

**Address:** Department of History, Faculty of Literature and Humanities, University of Isfahan, Azadi Square, Isfahan, I.R.Iran.

**Tel:** +98 (31) 37933121. **E-mail:** ryahinezhad@gmail.com

Historical criticism requires expertise and proficiency in general knowledge of history. In writing the critique of the article "Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the famous Iranian physician", year 2022, volume 24, number 1, none of the principles of historiography criticism have been observed. In this research, we will first investigate the disputed point of view of the article with the help, assistance and integration of two approaches of historical geography and medical history, and then we will further discuss the position of Annales historiography criticism in the field of medical history.

It is noteworthy that the article "a look at the historical geography of Tabaristan in the first two Hijri centuries" by Pargari in Al-Zahra University humanities journal No. 17 and 18 in 1996 has explained about the naming of the city of Tabaristan and the historical geography of this city. Referring to Ibn Esfandiari's book, they consider Tabaristan to have two parts, plain and mountain, and the city of Toranj was located in the plain area. On the website of Babol Persian Medicine School, there are also explanations about the location of the city of Toranj. This paper seeks to pave the way for innovation and new schools of research in the history of medicine (1).

Hakim Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji was one of the great scholars of medicine in the 10th century AD, and there is a difference of opinion among researchers about his birthplace. The date of his birth as well as the place of his birth are unknown, but historians consider the year of his death to be between 969 and 976 AD (2). The most important work left from this physician is "Moalejat Boqratieh", which has provided explanations about medical practice and education, as well as surgical matters. He used to practice medicine in Mu'izz al-Dawla and Rukn al-Dawla. Before examining the "A Critique of the Article, Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the Famous Iranian Physician", the position of criticism in the writings of medical history should be determined. The concept of "criticism" is adopted for examining and evaluating the value of something, or examining the strengths and weaknesses of a work in order to determine its nature or limitations, or to determine its compliance with accepted standards (2).

In writing the critique of the article "Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the famous Iranian physician", in 2022, volume 24, number 1, it seems that the principles of critical writing are not in accordance with historical criticism. The critique includes different types such as historical, moral, social and psychological criticism. Evaluation of historical sources is done in two ways, external and internal criticism. External criticism is a criticism that examines the nature of a historical writing while internal criticism evaluates the content of a writing. The historian must recognize the "error" whose avoidance is under his/her control on the path of reaching the truth whose avoidance is out of his/her control (3).

The idea that the documents in private files of government departments, like geological layers, are historical objective evidence, is not a correct idea. In criticism, elements such as the originality of the text, the author or producer, the research program, the reader, and the critic's publications should be taken into consideration (4). Furthermore, a critic in the field of historiography of historical geography should have the knowledge of using sciences and techniques that help historiography including: papyrology, calligraphy,

epigraphy, historical literature, numismatics, semantics, cryptology, geography, local history, bibliography, archeology, chronology, methodology, genealogy and nomenclature. Paying attention to criticism, criticism of influence and social criticism also has a decisive role in external criticism, dating, recognition of the original text and what is related to the authenticity and attribution of texts (5, 6).

By looking at the criticized article, it can be seen that the aim of the author of the article, "Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the famous Iranian physician", 2018, Volume 20, Number 10, was nothing but an introduction and review of his life, scientific experiences, and his medical book, *Risalah al-Boqratiyeh*, and this review does not include the historical geography of the author's hometown. The author wrote this article for the history of medicine group and readers in the field of medicine (7), not readers in the highly specialized field of historical geography. Dear critics should keep in mind that historical geography has many of these uncertainties; In Khuzestan, Khorasan, Mazandaran, and Sistan, there were cities whose remains exist today, and due to various reasons, such as floods, earthquakes, and war, their exact locations are not known or have been changed. In the historical geography of Toranj, Islami Saravi in the book "Mazandaran in History" believes that: "In history, this city is considered to be around the village of Beshel, between Qaemshahr and Shirgah" (8). Ibn al-Faqih writes in the book "Mukhtar al-Kitab al-Baldan": "The central city of Tabaristan is Amol, and it is the seat of governors, and it is the largest city of Tabaristan. Then, there is Mamatir and there is a distance of six farsang between these two cities. Then there is Toranj, which is a small city and is six farsang away from Mamatir..." (9). To some extent, the opinion of the author of the article "Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the famous Iranian physician" confirms the location of Toranj near and south of Babol (7).

The only way to guide the rhythm of medical history research in the field of medical historiography as well as scholarly criticism in a new way is to rely on the school of French analysts. One of the main uses of the Annales school was to build their work in the fields of geography, archeology, sociology, economics and psychology along with the leaders of these sciences. With the attitude that history is the analysis of human experience, they worked hard for the unity of human sciences, including history. Between the two world wars, the Annales school wrote more than forty volumes of books about the progress of humanity, which in fact was the growth and evolution of man in different dimensions with the help of neighboring sciences and shared with history. The effort of the Annales school in breaking the boundaries of human sciences and destroying the specialized walls drawn by traditional historians and introducing humanism into the body of knowledge and human achievements was a conscious work in the field of human sciences. Humans cannot be known except with this precise and intelligent method, and the works of humans, which are hidden in history, can only be evaluated by the sciences that are responsible for "knowing" humans and clarify the secrets of humans (10). In the meantime, the analysts said: "Let's rebuild history", "New national movement", "New social organizations", "History is not only documents", "We have a lot of unwritten history, which is no less valuable than the written ones." We have to discover, find and rebuild them" (10).

The two positive points of the article are the introduction of historical geography and medical history, which are important topics of the historiography of the Annales school, and the integration of these two together for critical research (11). The second positive point is the narration of various quotes in the research (11). However, the last point is not answering this question; where is Toranj? Critics should be aware of the exact location of Toranj. Criticism of historiography in the field of historical geography reaches its goal when the discourse of the authors of the article reaches its final goal. Not to confuse the reader. In order to examine the historical geography of Toranj city, critics have not paid any attention to the views of historians and critical and scientific researches, and this research cannot be a proper criticism in the field of historical geography.

## References

1. Pargari S. A look at the historical geography of Tabaristan in the first two centuries of Hijri. J Human Al-Zahra Univ. 1996;6(17,18):33-56. [In Persian] Available from: <http://ensani.ir/file/download/article/20120426185450-5200-86.pdf>
2. Hazrati H. An Introduction to Historical Criticism. J Book Month Hist Geogr. 2009;13(140):2-9. [In Persian] Available from: <https://www.magiran.com/paper/696807>
3. Nazemian Fard A. Considerations of Historical Criticism Some major errors in historiography. J Book Month Hist Geogr. 1999;3(21):19-20. [In Persian] Available from: <http://ensani.ir/file/download/article/20120426104729-4034-101.pdf>
4. Molaei Tavani AR. An Introduction to Research Methods in History. Iran, Tehran: Nashr-e-Ney; 2007. p. 141. [In Persian]
5. Samaran Ch. Research Methods in History, vol 2. [Translated by: Bigonah A, Zat Olyan Gh, Yaghmaei A]. Iran, Mashhad: Islamic Research Foundation, Astan Quds Razavi; 1992. p. 238. [In Persian]
6. Yerofehyev NA. What is History? [Translated by: Taqi Zad M]. Iran, Tehran: Javan; 1981. p. 74-81. [In Persian]
7. Golshani SA. Abolhassan Ahmad bin Mohammad Tabari Toranji; The famous Iranian Physician. J Babol Univ Med Sci. 2018;20(10):71-4. [In Persian]
8. Islami Saravi H. Mazandaran in history, vol 1. Sari: Shelfin; 2011. p. 139. [In Persian] Available from: <https://lib.ui.ac.ir/dl/search/default.aspx?Term=108969&Field=0&DTC=1>
9. Ibn al-Faqih AM. Mokhtasar al-Buldan, [Translated by: Hakimi MR]. Iran, Tehran: Bonyad-e-Farhang-e-Iran; 2000. p. 147. [In Persian]
10. Radmanesh E. Historical Scools and Modernism of History. Iran, Tehran: Peyk-e-Setare-e-Danesh; 2001. p. 129-32. [In Persian]
11. Hashemimehr SM, Rezaei Orimi J. A Critique of the Article “Abu al-Hasan Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Tabari Toranji; the Famous Iranian Physician”. J Babol Univ Med Sci. 2022;24(1):66-9. [In Persian]